IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

MARVEL CHARACTERS, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

LAWRENCE D. LIEBER,

Defendant.

LAWRENCE D. LIEBER,

Counterclaimant,

v.

MARVEL CHARACTERS, INC., and DOES 1-10, inclusive,

Counterclaim-Defendants.

MARVEL CHARACTERS, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

PATRICK S. DITKO, in his capacity as Administrator of the Estate of Stephen J. Ditko,

Defendant.

PATRICK S. DITKO, in his capacity as Administrator of the Estate of Stephen J. Ditko,

Counterclaimant,

v.

MARVEL CHARACTERS, INC. and DOES 1-10, inclusive,

Counterclaim-Defendants.

Case No.: 1:21-cv-7955-LAK and consolidated cases 21-cv-7957-LAK and 21-cv-7959-LAK

JOINT STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING SUBPOENAS AND SUBPOENA RESPONSES

MARVEL CHARACTERS, INC.,

Plaintiff,

v.

KEITH A. DETTWILER, in his capacity as Executor of the Estate of Donald L. Heck,

Defendant.

KEITH A. DETTWILER, in his capacity as Executor of the Estate of Donald L. Heck

Counterclaimant,

v.

MARVEL CHARACTERS, INC. and DOES 1-10, inclusive,

Counterclaim-Defendants.

STIPULATION

Plaintiff and Counterclaim-Defendant Marvel Characters, Inc. and Defendants and Counterclaimants Lawrence D. Lieber, Patrick S. Ditko, and Keith A. Dettwiler (collectively, the "Parties") stipulate as follows:

WHEREAS, four other actions are currently pending in this Court and the United States District Courts for the Eastern District of New York and the Central District of California: *Marvel Characters, Inc. v. Ditko*, No. 1:21-cv-07957-LAK (S.D.N.Y.); *Marvel Characters, Inc. v. Dettwiler*, No. 1:21-cv-07959-LAK (S.D.N.Y.)¹; *Marvel Characters, Inc. v. Solo*, No. 1:21-cv-05316-DG-TAM (E.D.N.Y.); and *Marvel Characters, Inc. v. Hart-Rico*, No. 2:21-cv-07624-DMG-KES (C.D. Cal.) (together with the above-captioned action, the "Pending Actions").

WHEREAS, the Parties expect third-party witnesses to have information relevant to the Pending Actions.

-

¹ On March 25, 2022, the Court consolidated the three cases in this jurisdiction for all pretrial purposes. *See* Order (ECF No. 38), *Marvel Characters, Inc. v. Lieber*, No. 1:21-cv-07955-LAK (S.D.N.Y.); Order (ECF No. 30), *Marvel Characters, Inc. v. Ditko*, No. 1:21-cv-07957-LAK (S.D.N.Y.); Order (ECF No. 36), *Marvel Characters, Inc. v. Dettwiler*, No. 1:21-cv-07959-LAK (S.D.N.Y.).

WHEREAS, the Parties agree that third-party discovery in the Pending Actions should be conducted in an efficient manner, so as to reduce the burden both to the Parties and third parties.

Based on the foregoing, **IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED** by and between the Parties, through their respective counsel of record, subject to the Court's approval, that:

- Any third-party subpoena and related notice of subpoena served in any of the Pending Actions shall be deemed served in all the Pending Actions.
- 2. All responses served, documents produced, and/or testimony provided in any of the Pending Actions in response to any such third-party subpoena shall likewise be deemed served, produced, and/or provided in all the Pending Actions.

Dated: April 18, 2022 O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

> /s/ Daniel M. Petrocelli
> Daniel M. Petrocelli By:

Daniel M. Petrocelli* dpetrocelli@omm.com Molly M. Lens mlens@omm.com Danielle Feuer* dfeuer@omm.com 1999 Avenue of the Stars, 8th Floor Los Angeles, California 90067 Telephone: (310) 553-6700 Facsimile: (310) 246-6779

Allen Burton aburton@omm.com Times Square Tower 7 Times Square New York, NY 10036 Telephone: (212) 326-2000

Facsimile: (212) 326-2061

Kendall Turner* kendallturner@omm.com 1625 I Street NW Washington, DC 20006 Telephone: (202) 383-5300 Facsimile: (202) 383-5414

Attorneys for Marvel Characters, Inc.

^{*} Admitted pro hac vice

Dated: April 18, 2022 **TOBEROFF & ASSOCIATES, P.C.**

> /s/ Marc Toberoff
> Marc Toberoff By:

Marc Toberoff mtoberoff@toberoffandassociates.com 23823 Malibu Road, Suite 50-363 Malibu, CA 90265 Telephone: (310) 246-3333 Facsimile: (310) 246-3101

Attorneys for Lawrence D. Lieber, Patrick S. Ditko, and Keith A. Dettwiler

SO ORDERED:	

Hon. Lewis A. Kaplan
United States District Judge

DATE:_____